

***Art & Architectural Review Board:
2014-2016***



**DEPARTMENT OF
GENERAL SERVICES**

Serving Government. Serving Virginians.

Submitted: October 1, 2016

Submitted by: Robert S. Mills, FAIA, Chair, Art and Architectural Review Board

Prepared by: Department of General Services' Division of Engineering and Buildings

Table of Contents

Authority 1
Membership 2
Role of the Department of General Services 2
Meeting Information 2
Project Submissions 3
AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2014 3
AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2015 4
AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2016 5
AARB Project Review: Overall Analysis 6
 1. Effective Use of the Consent Agenda 6
 2. Appropriate Schedule 6
 3. Value Added 6
APPENDIX A: Guidelines for Submissions and Presentations

I hereby submit this biennial report for review by the Governor and General Assembly in accordance with Paragraph F., Section 2.2-2400, Code of Virginia.

Signed



Robert S. Mills, FAIA, CID
Chair
Art and Architectural Review Board

9/27/16
Date

Authority

The Art and Architectural Review Board (AARB or the Board) is established by § 2.2-2400 et seq. of the Code of Virginia as an advisory board in the executive branch of government. Executive Order 88 (2001) delegates the Governor's responsibility regarding AARB to the Director of the Department of General Services (DGS).

Membership

According to § 2.2-2400 of the Code of Virginia, the Board is comprised of six members, as follows:

- The Director of the Department of Historic Resources or his/her designee (ex officio)
- Five citizen members appointed by the Governor:
 - An architect nominated by Virginia Society of the American Institute of Architects;
 - A nominee selected by the governing board of the University of Virginia (optional);
 - A member of the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts (VMFA) board of trustees; and
 - Two members appointed from the Commonwealth at large, of which one shall be a painter or sculptor.

Board Membership (fiscal years: July 1-June 30)

2014	2015	2016
Robert Mills, Chair	Robert Mills, Chair	Robert Mills, Chair
Burt Pinnock, Vice-Chair	Burt Pinnock, Vice-Chair	Burt Pinnock, Vice-Chair
Calder Loth, DHR representative	Calder Loth, DHR representative	Calder Loth, DHR representative
Sanford Bond	Sanford Bond	Sanford Bond
Helen Wilson	Helen Wilson	Helen Wilson
Donna Tuten*	Donna Tuten	Donna Tuten
Faith Norrell*		

**Ms. Norrell resigned in April 2015; Ms. Tuten was appointed in August 2015*

Role of the Department of General Services

In accordance with § 2.2-2400, Code of Virginia, the Department of General Services' Division of Engineering and Buildings (DEB) provides assistance to the Board in the undertaking of its responsibilities. On a monthly basis, this includes coordinating the meeting agendas, receiving and preparing submissions for review, scheduling and staffing the meetings, and producing meeting minutes for distribution.

Meeting Information

Meeting dates, locations, agendas, and minutes are listed on the AARB page on the DGS website: www.dgs.virginia.gov/DivisionofEngineeringandBuildings/DirectorsOffice/AARB.

Questions or comments concerning the AARB may be submitted to the Division of Engineering and Buildings: AARB@dgs.virginia.gov, or (804) 786-3263.

Project Submissions

Submissions must comply with DEB-issued Guidelines for Submittals and Presentations, available on the DGS website (listed above), and attached hereto as Appendix A.

At the discretion of the Board Chair, the following submissions may be placed on the Consent Agenda (and do not require agency representation at the meeting): (i) projects of a small-scale with clear and well-documented scope of work, or (ii) demolitions that also require DHR review.

AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2014

Table 1: Fiscal Year 2014

Month	Consent Agenda		Project Agenda		TOTAL	
	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes
Jul-13	6	0	11	3	17	3
Aug-13	3	0	4	1	7	1
Sep-13	9	1	3	2	12	3
Oct-13	10	0	7	4	17	4
Nov-13	2	0	9	2	11	2
Dec-13	9	1	11	5	20	6
Jan-14	11	0	4	0	15	0
Feb-14	1	0	6	1	7	1
Mar-14	4	0	11	6	15	6
Apr-14	10	0	10	4	20	4
May-14	18	3	8	4	26	7
Jun-14	5	0	10	2	15	2
Monthly Avgs	7.3	0.4	7.8	2.8	15.2	3.3
TOTALS	88	5	94	34	182	39

AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2015

Table 2: Fiscal Year 2015

Month	Consent Agenda		Project Agenda		TOTAL	
	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes
Jul-14	8	1	4	2	12	3
Aug-14	4	0	3	3	7	3
Sep-14	5	0	4	2	9	2
Oct-14	8	0	7	5	15	5
Nov-14	5	0	5	2	10	2
Dec-14	9	0	4	1	13	1
Jan-15	6	0	3	3	9	3
Feb-15	11	1	3	2	14	3
Mar-15	5	0	5	3	10	3
Apr-15	9	0	8	3	17	3
May-15	10	0	5	5	15	5
Jun-15	10	0	6	4	16	4
Monthly Avgs	7.5	0.2	4.8	2.9	12.3	3.1
TOTALS	90	2	57	35	147	37

AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2016

Table 3: Fiscal Year 2016

Month	Consent Agenda		Project Agenda		TOTAL	
	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes
Jul-15	4	0	5	5	9	5
Aug-15	10	0	4	3	14	3
Sep-15	8	0	5	2	13	2
Oct-15	3	0	5	3	8	3
Nov-15	6	0	11	6	17	6
Dec-15	9	0	1	0	10	0
Jan-16	4	0	7	5	11	5
Feb-16	5	0	2	2	7	2
Mar-16	8	0	5	5	13	5
Apr-16	12	0	6	4	18	4
May-16	7	0	10	6	17	6
Jun-16	7	0	3	0	10	0
Monthly Avgs	6.9	0.0	5.3	3.4	12.3	3.4
TOTALS	83	0	64	41	147	41

AARB Project Review: Overall Analysis

Table 4: Three Year Totals

Fiscal Year	Consent Agenda			Project Agenda			TOTAL		
	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	% of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	% of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	% of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes
2014	88	5	5.7%	94	34	36.2%	182	39	21.4%
2015	90	2	2.2%	57	35	61.4%	147	37	25.2%
2016	83	0	0.0%	64	41	64.1%	147	41	27.9%
TOTALS	261	7	2.7%	215	110	51.2%	476	117	24.6%
AVERAGES	87	2	2.6%	72	37	53.9%	159	39	24.8%

1. Use of the Consent Agenda

As reflected in Tables 4 and 5, 261 projects, or a little more than half of all projects from 2014-2016, were placed on the Consent Agenda. Of those, the Board recommended changes to only seven projects (3 percent). Consent Agenda projects do not require agency representation at the monthly meetings, maximizing placement on this agenda enables Board review in an efficient way that minimizes expenditure of agency resources.

Table 5: Allocation of Projects Between Consent and Project Agenda

	2014	2015	2016	Average
% of Projects on the Consent Agenda	48%	61%	56%	55%
% of Projects on the Project Agenda	52%	39%	44%	45%

2. Schedule

The average number of projects reviewed per monthly meeting was 15.2 for FY 2014 and 12.3 for both FY 2015 and FY 2016. Monthly meetings on a consistent schedule support the agencies' need for timely submission and review to support project progress.

3. Value Added

Of the 476 projects submitted for Board review from 2014-2016, the Board provided comments on 117 projects, or 25 percent of all projects reviewed by the Board. Of these 117 projects, Board recommendations were overturned on only three projects.

APPENDIX A

**VIRGINIA ART AND ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
BOARD (AARB)**



**DEPARTMENT OF
GENERAL SERVICES**

Serving Government. Serving Virginians.

Guidelines for Submissions and Presentations

Revised June 2016

Table of Contents

(Click to go to the subsection)

– Board Membership	2
– When Board Review Is Required	2
– Meeting Logistics	2
– Submission Logistics	3
– Submission Content	3
– Requesting Consent Agenda	4
– Presentation Logistics	4
– Presentation Content	5
– AARB Code of Virginia Authority	
▪ § 2.2-2400	6
▪ § 2.2-2401	7
▪ § 2.2-2402	7-8
– Project Data Sheet	9

DGS Contact information

Contact DGS, if you have any questions, comments or suggestions about this process:

804-786-3263

AARB@dgs.virginia.gov

AARB Board Membership

- **Mr. Robert “Bob” Mills, AARB Chair**, Principal/Architect with Robert Mills Architects
- **Mr. Burchell “Burt” Pinnock, AARB Vice-Chair**: Principal/Architect with Baskervill
- **Mr. Sandford “Sandy” Bond**, Architect with 3North
- **Mr. Calder Loth**, Representative for the Department of Historic Resources
- **Ms. Donna Tuten**, Artist, Gallery 202; Court Reporter, Virginia ABC
- **Ms. Helen Wilson**, Landscape Architect with the University of Virginia

When Board Review Is Required*

* AARB review does not constitute review by DHR; visit www.dhr.virginia.gov for additional information. If you are not sure if Board review is necessary, please email AARB@dqs.virginia.gov.

- For any changes to the exterior of a facility
- For new construction, including temporary facilities erected for more than 180 days
- *Recommendation: Seek Board review when you have fair certainty of the exterior appearance of the facility, location, overall massing, materials, colors, landscaping, etc. For capital outlay projects, this is often at the fully-developed Schematic or early Preliminary phase.*

Meeting Logistics

- **Agenda**: Available on the [DEB website](#) the week-of the scheduled meeting
- **Dates**: Generally, meetings are held on **the first Friday of every month at 10:00am**
 - Meetings dates are subject to change to accommodate state holidays and Board attendance, please refer to the [DEB website](#) to confirm the next meeting date
- **Location**: Please refer to the [DEB website](#) to confirm the current meeting location; generally, meetings are held at **The Branch Museum**, 2501 Monument Avenue, Richmond, VA 23220.

Submission Logistics

- Submit to AARB@dgs.virginia.gov by 4:00pm on the Friday two weeks before the meeting date
- What to send:
 - The Project Data Sheet must be complete and included as the first page
 - All materials related to a single project must be submitted as one single PDF attachment (in 8^{1/2} x 11 or 11 x 17 Adobe PDF file format)
 - Any cover letter or related correspondence should appear in the body of the email
- Naming submissions:
 - File Name: AARB_Year_Month_Agency Name_Project Name
 - Email Subject Line: AARB_Agency Name_Project Name

Submission Content

- Required: a completed Project Data Sheet
- Recommended: In addition to the Project Data Sheet (and submitted with it as part of a single PDF document), the submission should include visuals showing:
 - Location and site plans
 - Building and/or landscape design,
 - Site (to establish architecture, landscape and/or historic context)
 - Materials
 - See Presentation Content section for additional information

Requesting the Consent Agenda

- The Consent Agenda is used to review:
 - Small-scale projects that have a clear and well-documented scope of work
 - Demolitions that are also required to undergo DHR review
- How to request Consent Agenda consideration:
 - Indicate on the Project Data Sheet if you are requesting Consent Agenda consideration
 - The Board Chair decides if there is sufficient information for an item to appear on the Consent Agenda (please check the Meeting Agenda on the DEB Website to confirm)
 - Typically, Consent Agenda items do not require Agency attendance at AARB meetings (again, please check the Meeting Agenda on the DEB Website to confirm)

Presentation Logistics

- Provided for you:
 - All project materials included in your electronic submission
 - Laptop
 - Projector
 - Screen
 - Tables for presentation of physical materials
- Bring (if applicable):
 - Any updated or supplementary presentation materials: please put on a flash drive or disk (no paper handouts) and bring to the front side table immediately prior to your presentation.
 - *NOTE: please email supplementary/updated materials presented at the meeting to AARB@dqs.virginia.gov*
 - Physical samples of materials (i.e. samples of brick, glass, paneling, etc.)
- Length of Presentation:
 - Indicate time needed on the Project Data Sheet
 - Recommended length is 10-15 minutes (plus time for Board questions and discussion)
 - Please indicate on the Project Data Sheet if and why you may need additional time. The Chair will make a reasonable effort to accommodate such requests.

Presentation Content

- **Tone:** Presentations should be organized and well prepared but not be elaborate or overly formal. Explain the project using clear, simple exhibits and a concise narrative.
- **For initial presentations on a project:**
 - Use: Indicate the use of the building (i.e. classroom, library, laboratory, dormitory, etc.)
 - Context: Show photographs and illustrations that establish the context of the project, with particular attention to those architecture and landscape features that contribute to the identity of the institution or site. Indicate the relationship of the project to the surrounding community, historic significance, adjacent sites, and agency master plan.
 - Mass, Scale, Form and Architectural Character: Discuss the impact of the proposed design on existing views and the mass and scale of nearby structures. Exhibits should clearly differentiate between existing and proposed projects. Explain how the proposed design conforms to the architectural and planning principles embodied in the master plan or in precedent examples. Describe and illustrate proposed materials, colors, finishes and details. Include a brief description of the proposed site development, including grading, site drainage, paving, lighting, plant material and site furniture (ex: benches). Include discussion of land use policy, pedestrian and vehicular circulation systems, landforms, and architectural character
- **For return presentations on the same project:**
 - State when previous presentation(s) were made on the project
 - Restate previous Board comments
 - Briefly review project
 - Show actions taken to address Board comments; use visuals to compare previous renderings with updates

Authority granted to the AARB by the Code of Virginia

Section 2.2-2400: Art and Architectural Review Board; members and officers; travel expenses; quorum; compensation; staff; report.

A. The Art and Architectural Review Board (the Board) is established as an advisory board, within the meaning of § 2.2-2100, in the executive branch of state government. The Board shall consist of six members as follows: the Director of the Department of Historic Resources, or his designee, serving as an ex officio member and five citizen members, appointed by the Governor. Of the citizen members, one shall be an architect who may be appointed from a list of two or more architects nominated by the governing board of the Virginia Society of the American Institute of Architects; one may be appointed from a list of two or more persons nominated by the governing board of the University of Virginia; one shall be a member of the board of trustees of the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts; and two shall be appointed from the Commonwealth at large, one of whom shall be a painter or sculptor. Lists of nominees shall be submitted at least 60 days before the expiration of the member's term for which the nominations are being made in order to be considered by the Governor in making appointments pursuant to this section.

B. Beginning July 1, 2011, the Governor's appointments of the five citizen members shall be staggered as follows: two members for a term of one year, two members for a term of two years, and one member for a term of three years. Thereafter, members of the Board shall be appointed for terms of four years each, except appointments to fill vacancies, which shall be for the unexpired terms. No member shall serve for more than two consecutive four-year terms, except that any member appointed to the unexpired term of another shall be eligible to serve two consecutive four-year terms. Vacancies shall be filled in the manner of the original appointments. The Director of the Department of Historic Resources shall serve a term coincident with his term of office.

C. Annually, the Board shall elect a chairman and vice-chairman and may elect such other officers as the Board deems proper from among its membership. A majority of the members of the Board shall constitute a quorum.

D. The members of the Board shall serve without compensation, but shall be reimbursed for all reasonable and necessary expenses incurred in the discharge of their duties as provided in § 2.2-2825.

E. The Division of Engineering and Buildings of the Department of General Services shall provide assistance to the Board in the undertaking of its responsibilities.

F. The Board shall submit a biennial report to the Governor and General Assembly on or before October 1 of each even-numbered year.

Authority granted to the AARB by the Code of Virginia, (cont.)

Section 2.2-2401: Works of art accepted by Governor; approval by Board; meaning of "work of art"

A. The Governor may accept, in the name of the Commonwealth, gifts to the Commonwealth of works of art as defined in subsection B. But no work of art shall be so accepted until submitted to the Board or otherwise brought to its attention for its advice and counsel to the Governor.

B. As used in this article, "work of art" means all paintings, mural decorations, stained glass, statues, bas-reliefs, tablets, sculptures, monuments, fountains, arches or other structure of a permanent character intended for ornament or commemoration.

Section 2.2-2402: Governor's approval of works of art; removal, etc.; structures, fixtures and works of art placed on or extending over state property.

A. No work of art shall become the property of the Commonwealth by purchase, gift or otherwise, unless the work of art or a design thereof, together with its proposed location, have been submitted to and approved by the Governor acting with the advice and counsel of the Board. Nor shall any work of art, until so submitted and approved, be contracted for, placed in or upon or allowed to extend over any property belonging to the Commonwealth. No existing work of art owned by the Commonwealth shall be removed, relocated or altered in any way without submission to the Governor.

This subsection shall not apply to any portrait, tablet or work of art portraying, or pertaining to, a present or former Governor and presented to, or acquired, by the Governor and displayed in that part of the building under the direct supervision of the Governor or a present or former presiding officer of the Senate or a member or former member of the Supreme Court, the Senate, or the House of Delegates, presented to, or acquired by, the member's or presiding officer's respective body and displayed in that part of any building under the direct supervision and jurisdiction of such body nor shall they apply to any portrait, tablet or work of art acquired by the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts or museums operated in conjunction with art or architectural departments at public colleges or universities in Virginia.

B. No construction or erection of any building or any appurtenant structure of any nature, which is to be placed on or allowed to extend over any property belonging to the Commonwealth, and no construction or erection of any bridge, arch, gate, fence, or other structure or fixture intended primarily for ornamental or memorial purposes, and which is to be paid for, either wholly or in part by appropriation from the state treasury, and, which is to be placed on or allowed to extend over any property belonging to the Commonwealth, shall be begun, unless the design and proposed location thereof have been submitted to the Governor and its artistic character approved in writing by him acting with the advice and counsel of the Board, unless the Governor has failed to disapprove in writing the design within thirty days after its submission. No existing structure of the kinds described in this subsection, owned by

Authority granted to the AARB by the Code of Virginia, (cont.)

Section 2.2-2402 (cont.): Governor's approval of works of art; removal, etc.; structures, fixtures and works of art placed on or extending over state property

the Commonwealth, shall be removed, remodeled or added to, nor shall any appurtenant structure be attached without submission to the Governor and the artistic character of the proposed new structure approved in writing by him acting with the advice and counsel of the Board, unless the Governor has failed to disapprove in writing the design within thirty days after its submission.

C. No work of art not owned by the Commonwealth shall be placed in or upon or allowed to extend over any property belonging to the Commonwealth for a period of more than two years unless such work of art or a design thereof has been submitted to and approved by the Governor acting with the advice and counsel of the Board.

This subsection shall not apply to the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts or museums operated in conjunction with art or architectural departments at public colleges and universities in Virginia.

ART AND ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD (AARB)

Project Data Sheet

Revised 2016

(Due two weeks before meeting to: AARB@dgs.virginia.gov)

Date Submitted:

Agency Name:

Project Name and Number

(Include project name, number/code and location, i.e. city, county, etc.)

Representatives for the Agency and the Architect/Engineer

(Include names, titles, phone numbers—including contact information for the day-of the meeting, email, address)

Current Project Status/Phase and Schedule

(Status/Phase = Schematic, etc. Schedule= next milestone date)

Project Description

(Area, number of stories, building and roof forms, exterior materials, etc.)

Architectural Aesthetic:

(What does it look like and why?)

Relationship to Approved Master Plan

(Include date of master plan and how this project relates to a larger program effort, if applicable)

Existing Architectural Context

(The surrounding community, historic significance, adjacent site, the identity of the agency or institution, etc.)

AARB History *(for return presentations on the same project):*

- **Meeting date(s) previously presented to Board:**
- **Previous Board comments:**
- **Agency response to Board comments:**

Estimated Time required for the Presentation

(suggested length: 10-15 minutes. If more time is needed, briefly explain why)

Request for Consent Agenda: Yes: No: