Art & Architectural Review Board Report for the 2020-2022 Biennium



DEPARTMENT OF GENERAL SERVICES

Serving Government. Serving Virginians.

Submitted: October 1, 2022

Submitted by: Lynden P. Garland, Jr., Chair, Art and Architectural Review Board

Prepared by: Department of General Services

Table of Contents

Autho	Drity	1
Meml	bership	2
Role	of the Department of General Services	2
Meeti	ing Information	2
Projec	ct Submissions	3
AAR	B Project Review: Fiscal Year 2020	3
AAR	B Project Review: Fiscal Year 2021	3
AAR	B Project Review: Fiscal Year 2022	4
AAR	B Project Review: Overall Analysis	6
1.	Effective Use of the Consent Agenda	6
2.	Appropriate Schedule	6
3.	Value Added	6
APPE	ENDIX A: Guidelines for Submissions and Presentations	

I hereby submit this biennial report for review by the Governor and General Assembly in accordance with subsection F of Va. Code § 2.2-2400.

Signed AND GARI JRA

<u>9/9/22</u> Date

rt and Architectural Review Board

Authority

The Art and Architectural Review Board (AARB or the Board) is established in Article 1 (§ 2.2-2400 et seq.) of Chapter 24 of Title 2.2 of the Code of Virginia as an advisory board in the executive branch of government. Executive Order 88 (2001) delegates the Governor's responsibility regarding AARB to the Director of the Department of General Services (DGS).

Membership

According to Va. Code § 2.2-2400, the Board is comprised of seven members, as follows:

- The Director of the Department of Historic Resources or his/her designee (ex officio); and
- Six citizen members appointed by the Governor:
 - An architect who may be nominated by Virginia Society of the American Institute of Architects;
 - An individual who may be nominated by the governing board of the University of Virginia;
 - A member of the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts (VMFA) board of trustees; and
 - Three members appointed from the Commonwealth at large, one of whom must be a painter or sculptor.

2020	2021	2022
Burt Pinnock, Chair	Burt Pinnock, Chair	Burt Pinnock, Chair
Helen Wilson, Vice-Chair	Helen Wilson, Vice-Chair	Helen Wilson, Vice-Chair
Calder Loth, DHR representative	Calder Loth, DHR representative	Calder Loth, DHR representative
Ian Vaughan	Ian Vaughan	Ian Vaughan
Tom Papa	Tom Papa	Tom Papa
Donna Jackson	Donna Jackson	Donna Jackson
Rebecca Deeds	Rebecca Deeds	Rebecca Deeds

Board Membership (fiscal years: July 1-June 30)

Role of the Department of General Services

Pursuant to Va. Code § <u>2.2-2400</u>, the Department of General Services provides administrative assistance to the Board to assist it in undertaking its responsibilities. On a monthly basis, this includes coordinating the meeting agendas, receiving and preparing submissions for review, scheduling and staffing the meetings, and producing meeting minutes for distribution.

Meeting Information

Meeting dates, locations, agendas, and minutes are posted on the AARB page on DGS' website: https://dgs.virginia.gov/dgs/directors-office/aarb/ and on the Commonwealth Calendar. Questions or comments concerning the AARB may be submitted to the DGS Directors Office by emailing <u>AARB@dgs.virginia.gov</u> or calling (804) 786-3311.

Project Submissions

Project submissions must comply with the issued Guidelines for Submissions and Presentations, which is available on the DGS website and included in this report as Appendix A.

At the discretion of the Board's Chair, the following submissions are eligible for placement on the Consent Agenda (and do not require agency representation at the meeting): (i) projects of a small-scale with a clear and well-documented scope of work and (ii) demolitions that also require DHR review.

AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2020

	Consent	t Agenda	Regular	· Agenda	TOTAL		
Month	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommende d Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommende d Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommende d Changes	
Jul-19	19	0	10	5	29	5	
Aug-19	4	0	4	3	8	3	
Sept-19	9	5	10	6	19	11	
Oct-19	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
Nov-19	6	2	8	6	14	8	
Dec-19	5	0	5	5	10	5	
Jan-20	2	0	4	0	6	0	
Feb-20	1	0	4	1	5	1	
Mar-20	2	0	8	7	10	7	
Apr-20	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
*May-20	9	2	9	4	18	6	
*Jun-20	5	0	5	3	10	3	
Monthly Avgs	5.2	0.75	5.6	3.3	10.75	4.1	
TOTALS	62	9	67	40	129	49	

 Table 1: Fiscal Year 2020

*Denotes meetings held virtually

Consent Agenda			Regular	Agenda	TOTAL		
Month	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommende d Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommende d Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommende d Changes	
*Jul-20	4	0	8	6	12	6	
*Aug-20	4	0	6	4	10	4	
*Sep-20	9	0	4	4	13	4	
*Oct-20	6	0	4	3	10	3	
*Nov-20	6	0	10	8	16	8	
*Dec-20	5	0	3	2	8	2	
*Jan-21	9	0	3	3	12	3	
*Feb-21	9	0	3	3	12	3	
*Mar-21	7	0	0	0	7	0	
*Apr-21	5	2	2	1	7	3	
*May-21	5	0	0	0	5	0	
*Jun-21	6	0	5	0	11	0	
Monthly Avgs	6.25	.16	4	2.83	10.25	3	
TOTALS	75	2	48	34	123	36	

Table 2: Fiscal Year 2021

*Denotes meeting held virtually

AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2022

	Consent	t Agenda	Regular Agenda TO			TAL
Month	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommende d Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommende d Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommende d Changes
Jul-21	12	0	5	3	17	3
Aug-21	2	0	4	2	6	2
Sep-21	11	0	3	3	14	3
Oct-21	8	0	1	1	9	1
Nov-21	10	0	4	4	14	4
Dec-21	5	0	5	4	10	4
Jan-22	5	0	4	4	9	4
Feb-22	6	0	3	2	9	2
Mar-22	8	0	2	2	10	2
Apr-22	8	0	5	2	13	2
May-22	7	0	3	2	10	2
Jun-22	1	0	7	3	8	3
Monthly Avgs	6.9	0	3.8	2.6	10.75	2.6
TOTALS	83	0	46	32	129	32

Table 3: Fiscal Year 2022

*Denotes meetings held virtually.

AARB Project Review: Overall Analysis

Table 4: Three real rotals										
	(Consent Ag	enda	Regular Agenda			TOTAL			
Fiscal Year	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	% of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	% of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	% of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	
2020	62	9	14.5%	67	40	59.7%	129	49	37.9%	
2021	75	2	2.6%	48	34	70.83%	123	36	29.26%	
2022	83	0	0%	46	32	69.6%	129	32	24.8%	
TOTALS	220	11	5%	161	106	65.84%	381	117	30.71%	
AVERAGES	73.33	3.66	4.99%	53.66	35.33	65.84%	127	39	30.71%	

Table 4: Three Year Totals

1. Use of the Consent Agenda

As reflected in Table 5 below, 220 projects from 2020-2022 were placed on the Consent Agenda. Of those, the Board recommended changes to only eleven projects (5% percent). Consent Agenda projects do not require agency representation at the monthly meetings. As such, maximizing the placement of projects on the Consent Agenda both allows the Board to review projects efficiently and minimizes expenditure of agency resources.

Table 5: Allocation of Projects Between Consent and Project Agenda

	2020	2021	2022	Average
% of Projects on the Consent Agenda	48%	61%	64%	58%
% of Projects on the Project Agenda	52%	39%	25%	39%

2. Schedule

The average number of projects reviewed per monthly meeting was 10.75 for FY 2020, 10.25 for FY 2021 and 10.75 FY 2022. Holding monthly meetings on a consistent schedule supports agencies' need for timely project review and in turn supports timely project progression.

3. Value Added

Of the 381 projects submitted for Board review from 2020-2022, the Board provided comments on 117 projects, or 30.71 percent of all projects reviewed by the Board.

Appendix A

VIRGINIA ART AND ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD (AARB)



Serving Government. Serving Virginians.

AGENCY GUIDELINES FOR SUBMISSIONS AND PRESENTATIONS

Revised July 1, 2022

Table of Contents

(Click to go to the subsection)

-	1. Purpose of the AARB	3
_	2. AARB Code of Virginia Authority	
	§ 2.2-2400	4-5
	§ 2.2-2401	5
	■ § 2.2-2402	5-6
-	3.AARB Board Membership	7
_	4. Meeting Logistics	7
-	5. Submission Logistics	7-8
_	6. Submission Content	8
-	7. Requesting Consent Agenda	8-9
-	8. Presentation Logistics	9
-	9. Presentation Consent	9-10
-	10. Questions On Submissions	11
	Attachments	
_	Project Data Sheet	12

DGS Contact information

Contact DGS, if you have any questions, comments or suggestions about this process: 804-786-0205 Preferred method of contact: <u>AARB@dgs.virginia.gov</u>

1. Purpose of the AARB

The AARB consists of six citizen members appointed by the Governor, plus a representative of the Department of Historic Resources, to advise on the "artistic character" of buildings and works of art which are to be paid for by the state, or to be located on or over state property. In practice, the AARB recommends approval or disapproval to the Director of the Department of General Services, to whom the Governor has delegated this authority. Membership criteria are set out in Section 2.2-2400 of the Code of Virginia.

The AARB interprets its mandate from the Commonwealth in straightforward terms: to encourage the design of buildings and works of art which are both aesthetically and functionally appropriate to the agency for which they are intended. While no rigid prescriptive standards exist, the AARB generally requires each submission to demonstrate:

- A resolution of basic functional and organizational requirements
- A command of the fundamental principles of good design, including refinement of color, form, scale, material, and craft
- A positive contribution to the order and aesthetic of the physical setting
- Due consideration of its environmental, historical, and cultural factors
- Concerns for the greater public good

2. Authority granted to the AARB by the Code of Virginia

§2.2-2400: Art and Architectural Review Board; members and officers; travel expenses; quorum; compensation; staff; report.

A. The Art and Architectural Review Board (the Board) is established as an advisory board, within the meaning of § 2.2-2100, in the executive branch of state government. The Board shall consist of seven voting members as follows: the Director of the Department of Historic Resources, or his designee, serving as an ex officio member and six citizen members, appointed by the Governor. Of the citizen members, one shall be an architect who may be appointed from a list of two or more architects nominated by the governing board of the Virginia Society of the American Institute of Architects; one may be appointed from a list of two or more persons nominated by the governing board of the University of Virginia; one shall be a member of the board of trustees of the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts; and three shall be appointed from the Commonwealth at large, one of whom shall be a painter or sculptor. Lists of nominees shall be submitted at least 60 days before the expiration of the member's term for which the nominations are being made in order to be considered by the Governor in making appointments pursuant to this section.

B. Following the initial staggering of terms, citizen members of the Board shall be appointed for terms of four years each, except appointments to fill vacancies, which shall be for the unexpired terms. No member shall serve for more than two consecutive four-year terms, except that any member appointed to the unexpired term of another shall be eligible to serve two consecutive four-year terms. Vacancies shall be filled in the manner of the original appointments. The Director of the Department of Historic Resources shall serve a term coincident with his term of office.

C. Annually, the Board shall elect a chairman and vice-chairman and may elect such other officers as the Board deems proper from among its membership. A majority of the members of the Board shall constitute a quorum.

D. The members of the Board shall serve without compensation, but shall be reimbursed for all reasonable and necessary expenses incurred in the discharge of their duties as provided in § 2.2-2825.

E. The Department of General Services shall provide assistance to the Board in the undertaking of its responsibilities.

F. The Board shall submit a biennial report to the Governor and General Assembly on or before October 1 of each even-numbered year.

§2.2-2401: Works of art accepted by Governor; approval by Board; meaning of "work of art"

A. The Governor may accept, in the name of the Commonwealth, gifts to the Commonwealth of works of art as defined in subsection B. But no work of art shall be so accepted until submitted to the Board or otherwise brought to its attention for its advice and counsel to the Governor.

B. As used in this article, "work of art" means all paintings, mural decorations, stained glass, statues, bas-reliefs, tablets, sculptures, monuments, fountains, arches or other structure of a permanent character intended for ornament or commemoration.

<u>§2.2-2402:</u> Governor's approval of works of art; removal, etc.; structures, fixtures and works of art placed on or extending over state property.

A. No work of art shall become the property of the Commonwealth by purchase, gift or otherwise, unless the work of art or a design thereof, together with its proposed location, have been submitted to and approved by the Governor acting with the advice and counsel of the Board. Nor shall any work of art, until so submitted and approved, be contracted for, placed in or upon or allowed to extend over any property belonging to the Commonwealth. No existing work of art owned by the Commonwealth shall be removed, relocated or altered in any way without submission to the Governor.

This subsection shall not apply to any portrait, tablet or work of art portraying, or pertaining to, a present or former Governor and presented to, or acquired, by the Governor and displayed in that part of the building under the direct supervision of the Governor or a present or former presiding officer of the Senate or a member or former member of the Supreme Court, the Senate, or the House of Delegates, presented to, or acquired by, the member's or presiding officer's respective body and displayed in that part of any building under the direct supervision and jurisdiction of such body nor shall they apply to any portrait, tablet or work of art acquired by the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts or museums operated in conjunction with art or architectural departments at public colleges or universities in Virginia.

B. No construction or erection of any building or any appurtenant structure of any nature, which is to be placed on or allowed to extend over any property belonging to the Commonwealth, and no construction or erection of any bridge, arch, gate, fence, or other structure or fixture intended primarily for ornamental or memorial purposes, and which is to be paid for, either wholly or in part by appropriation from the state treasury, and, which is to be placed on or allowed to extend over any property belonging to the Commonwealth, shall be begun, unless the design and proposed location thereof have been submitted to the Governor and its artistic character approved in writing by him acting with the advice and counsel of the Board, unless the Governor has failed to disapprove in writing the design within thirty days after its submission. No existing structure of the kinds described in this subsection, owned by the Commonwealth, shall be removed, remodeled or added to, nor shall any appurtenant structure be attached without submission to the Governor and the artistic character of the

proposed new structure approved in writing by him acting with the advice and counsel of the Board, unless the Governor has failed to disapprove in writing the design within thirty days after its submission.

C. No work of art not owned by the Commonwealth shall be placed in or upon or allowed to extend over any property belonging to the Commonwealth for a period of more than two years unless such work of art or a design thereof has been submitted to and approved by the Governor acting with the advice and counsel of the Board.

This subsection shall not apply to the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts or museums operated in conjunction with art or architectural departments at public colleges and universities in Virginia.

3. AARB Board Membership

The Board shall consist of seven voting members as follows: the Director of the Department of Historic Resources, or designee, serving as an ex officio member and six citizen members shall be staggered as follows: two members for a term of one year, two members for a term of two years, and two members for a term of three years. (see DGS website for current membership). Thereafter, members of the Board shall be appointed for terms of four years each, except appointments to fill vacancies, which shall be for the unexpired terms. No member shall serve for more than two consecutive four-year terms, except that any member appointed to the unexpired term of another shall be eligible to serve two consecutive four-year terms. Vacancies shall be filled in the manner of the original appointments. The Director of the Department of Historic Resources shall serve a term coincident with his term of office.

4. Meeting Logistics

- a. Agenda: Available on the <u>DGS website</u> the week-of the scheduled meeting, typically posted on the Monday prior to the meeting.
- b. Dates: Generally, meetings are held on the first Friday of every month at 10:00am Meetings dates are subject to change to accommodate state holidays and Board attendance, please refer to the DGS website to confirm the next meeting date. Meetings are also posted on the Commonwealth Calendar.
- c. Location: Please refer to the DGS website to confirm the current meeting location

5. Submission Logistics

Submit the following information to <u>AARB@dgs.virginia.gov</u> by **3:00pm on the Friday** two weeks prior to the meeting date. DGS will confirm receipt of project submissions within 24 hours. If you submit a project and do not receive a confirmation within 24 hours, please follow up by emailing AARB or calling 804-786-0205.

Note: Recommendation by DGS to seek Board review when you have fair certainty of the exterior appearance of the facility, location, overall massing, materials, colors, landscaping, etc. For capital outlay projects, this is often at the fully-developed Schematic or early Preliminary phase. This includes permanent fencing.

a. What to send:

- The <u>Project Data Sheet</u> must be complete and included as the first page (Attachment A)
- All materials and submission content explained below related to a single project must be submitted as one single PDF attachment (in $8^{1/2} \times 11$ or 11×17 Adobe PDF file format)
- Any cover letter or related correspondence should appear in the body of the email and/or be submitted as one complete document.
- All submissions must include the agency contact in the email distribution
- b. Required format for naming of submissions:
 - File Name: AARB_Year_Month_Agency Name_Project Name
 - Email Subject Line: AARB_Agency Name_Project Name

6. Submission Content

- a. Required: a completed Project Data Sheet
 - a. Preliminary approval is for projects often early in the process that are large and complex. Preliminary approval allows the board the opportunity to weigh in, early on, about the project and express any concerns or suggestions that will need to be addressed when the applicant comes back for Final Approval.

<u>b.</u> <u>Recommended</u>: In addition to the <u>Project Data Sheet</u> (and submitted with it as part of a single PDF document), the submission should include visuals showing:

- o Location and site plans
- Building and/or landscape design,
- Site (to establish architecture, landscape and/or historic context)
- o Materials
- See <u>Presentation Content</u> section for additional information

7. Requesting the Consent Agenda

- a. The Consent Agenda which can be approved in one action, rather than filing motions on each item separately, is used to review:
 - o Small-scale projects that have a clear and well-documented scope of work
 - o Demolitions that are also required to undergo DHR review
- b. How to request Consent Agenda consideration:
 - Indicate on the Project Data Sheet if you are requesting Consent Agenda consideration
 - The Board Chair decides if there is sufficient information for an item to appear on the Consent Agenda (please check the Meeting Agenda on the DGS Website to confirm)
 - Typically, Consent Agenda items do not require Agency attendance at AARB meetings (please check the Meeting Agenda on the DGS Website to confirm)

8. Presentation Logistics

- a. DGS Provides for the Agency presenting:
 - All project materials included in the Agency electronic submission
 - o Laptop
 - o Projector
 - o Screen
 - o Laser Pointer
- b. Bring (if applicable):
 - Any updated or supplementary presentation materials: please put on a flash drive or USB (no paper handouts).

NOTE: please email supplementary/updated materials presented at the meeting to <u>AARB@dqs.virginia.gov</u>

- Physical samples of materials (i.e. samples of brick, glass, paneling, etc.)
- c. Length of Presentation:
 - Project presentations shall be no longer than 15 minutes. Upon completion of the presentation, the Board reserves the right to ask questions and seek clarification on the project.

9. Presentation Content

- a. Presentations should be organized and well prepared but not be elaborate or overly formal. Explain the project using clear, simple exhibits and a concise narrative.
- b. For initial presentations on a project:
 - Use: Indicate the use of the building (i.e. classroom, library, laboratory, dormitory, etc.)
 - <u>Context</u>: Show photographs and illustrations that establish the context of the project, with particular attention to those architecture and landscape features that contribute to the identity of the institution or site. Indicate the relationship of the project to the surrounding community, historic significance, adjacent sites, and agency master plan.
 - <u>Mass, Scale, Form and Architectural Character</u>: Discuss the impact of the proposed design on existing views and the mass and scale of nearby structures. Exhibits should clearly differentiate between existing and proposed projects. Explain how the proposed design conforms to the architectural and planning principles embodied in the master plan or in precedent examples. Describe and illustrate proposed materials, colors, finishes and details. Include a brief description of the proposed site development, including grading, site drainage, paving, lighting, plant material and site furniture (ex: benches). Include discussion of land use policy, pedestrian and vehicular circulation systems, landforms, and architectural character
- c. For return presentations on the same project:
 - State when previous presentation(s) were made on the project
 - Restate previous Board comments
 - Briefly review project
 - Show actions taken to address Board comments; use visuals to compare previous renderings with updates

10. Questions On Submissions?

If you are not sure if Board review is necessary, please email <u>AARB@dgs.virginia.gov</u>

ART AND ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD (AARB)

Project Data Sheet

Revised July 1, 2022

(Due by 3:00 pm on the Friday two weeks before meeting to: AARB@dgs.virginia.gov)

Date Submitted:

Agency Name:

Project Name and Number (Include project name, number/code and location, i.e. city, county, etc.)

Representatives for the Agency and the Architect/Engineer (Include names, titles, phone numbers—including contact information for the day-of the meeting, email, address)

Current Project Status/Phase and Schedule Preliminary Approval: Final Approval: (Status/Phase = Schematic, etc. Schedule= next milestone date)

Project Description

(Area, number of stories, building and roof forms, exterior materials, etc.)

Architectural Aesthetic: (What does it look like and why?)

Relationship to Approved Master Plan (Include date of master plan and how this project relates to a larger program effort, if applicable)

Existing Architectural Context

(The surrounding community, historic significance, adjacent site, the identity of the agency or institution, etc.)

AARB History (for return presentations on the same project):

- Meeting date(s) previously presented to Board:
- Previous Board comments:
- Agency response to Board comments:

Estimated Time required for the Presentation (not to exceed 15 minutes)

Request for Consent Agenda: Yes: No:

<u>–</u>