

Jillian Balow Superintendent of Public Instruction DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION P.O. BOX 2120 RICHMOND, VA 23218-2120 Office: (804) 225-2057 Fax: (804) 371-2099

November 1, 2022

The Honorable Glenn A. Youngkin Governor of Virginia Patrick Henry Building, Third Floor 1111 East Broad Street Richmond, Virginia 23219

The Honorable Barry D. Knight Chair, House Appropriations Committee Virginia General Assembly 1852 Mill Landing Road Virginia Beach, Virginia 23457 The Honorable Janet D. Howell Co-Chair, Senate Finance and Appropriations Committee Virginia General Assembly P.O. Box 2608 Reston, Virginia 20195-0608

The Honorable George L. Barker Co-Chair, Senate Finance and Appropriations Committee Virginia General Assembly P.O. Box 10527 Alexandria, Virginia 22310

Dear Sirs and Madam:

I am pleased to submit the enclosed report on the alternative breakfast service model program from the 2021-2022 school year, as required by *Item 145 C.29.c.1)-3*, *Chapter 1, 2022 Special Session I Acts of Assembly*. In total, 419 schools participated in the program in 2021-2022, serving more than 14.5 million breakfast meals during the school year.

If you require additional information, please contact Kent C. Dickey, Deputy Superintendent of Budget, Finance, and Operations, at (804) 225-2025 or Kent.Dickey@doe.virginia.gov.

Sincerely,

Dicky Shanor for Jillian Balow

JB/am

Enclosure

c: The Honorable Aimee R. Guidera Secretary of Education

# **REPORT ON ALTERNATIVE SCHOOL BREAKFAST SERVICE MODELS**

Presented to: The Governor of Virginia House Appropriations Committee Senate Finance and Appropriations Committee

November 1, 2022

Virginia Department of Education P. O. Box 2120 Richmond, Virginia 23218-2120

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

AUTHORITY FOR THE STUDY	2
PROGRAM OVERVIEW	2
BREAKFAST MEALS SERVED	3
TEACHER AND ADMINISTRATOR SURVEY	3
FINANCIAL IMPACT	4
SUMMARY	4
APPENDICES	6
Appendix A	6
Appendix B	8

# **AUTHORITY FOR THE STUDY**

Chapter 1 of the 2022 Special Session I Acts of Assembly allotted funds to support schools that provide breakfast meals to eligible students through an alternative breakfast service model, commonly called breakfast after the bell. For this appropriation, the Virginia Department of Education (VDOE) is required to collect data from participating schools to evaluate the educational impact of the program and report the results to the Governor and the Chairs of the House Appropriations and Senate Finance and Appropriations Committees.

# **PROGRAM OVERVIEW**

Alternative school breakfast service models provide meals to students through a distribution method different from traditional cafeteria service, removing various obstacles that can prevent students from accessing school breakfast. The most effective alternative breakfast models allow students to eat their meal after the official start of the school day, commonly known as "breakfast after the bell." These models may include breakfast in the classroom, grab and go breakfast, or breakfast after first period.

The Chapter 1 budget provided \$1.074 million in state funds for the operation of alternative school breakfast service models implemented in the 2021-2022 school year. To receive funds, schools must have more than 45 percent of students qualifying for free or reduced-price meals. State reimbursement of five cents (\$0.05) in elementary schools and ten cents (\$0.10) in secondary schools per reimbursable meal served was allotted to each approved school in a division (see Appendix A for language from the Chapter 1 budget).

Wide variation in the availability of in-person instruction during the 2021-2022 school year and flexibilities in federal requirements allowed school divisions to tailor the methods by which they distributed breakfast meals to students. Examples of the ways in which school divisions distributed breakfast meals include bulk grab and go, and parent or guardian pick up of meals.

As is required by Chapter 1 of the 2022 Special Session I Acts of Assembly, the Virginia Department of Education (VDOE) collected required data from schools receiving funding for the alternative breakfast service model in program year 2021-2022. Due to the waived reporting requirements in the 2019-2020 and 2020-2021 program years, comprehensive comparative analysis of program data is limited for program year 2021-2022.

## **BREAKFAST MEALS SERVED**

The 419 schools participating in the alternative school breakfast program provided 14,534,951 breakfast meals to students during the 2021-2022 school year. Of those, 7,423,748 meals were provided by elementary schools and 7,111,203 meals were provided by secondary schools (see Table 1).

		<u>Total Meals</u>
<u>School Type</u>	Number of Schools	Served
Elementary	178	7,423,748
Middle/High	241	7,111,203
Total	419	14,534,951

Table 1. Eligible Breakfast Meals Served by School Type, 2021-2022 School Year

Due to the change from the traditional school breakfast program to the Summer Food Service Program or Seamless Summer Option, comparison of meals served to previous school year will not provide a meaningful analysis of the program's year-to-year growth. While the varying methods for distributing of breakfast meals make comparisons to previous years unhelpful, the flexibilities in program implementation allowed divisions to change their delivery models to meet the needs of students and families during the COVID-19 pandemic.

# **TEACHER AND ADMINISTRATOR SURVEY**

Division leaders, principals, teachers, school nutrition directors, and cafeteria managers from participating school divisions were surveyed about their perceptions of student participation in the program. While participating school divisions may implement various breakfast models, the majority of responses (74.1%) reported using a Grab and Go model, where students pick up packaged breakfasts from carts or kiosks or from the cafeteria and carry them to their classrooms. A majority of survey respondents (76.11%) agree that more students are eating breakfast as a result of the alternative breakfast programs in their schools. Additionally, more

than seventy percent (71.2%) of respondents agree that fewer students are hungry in the morning and that the program reduces stigma around eating breakfast at school (71.25%).

A plurality of respondents had no opinion on the alternative breakfast program's impact on improving student academic performance (46.23%), improvements in student attendance and tardiness (42.33%), student behavior improvement (43.93%), improvement in overall classroom environment (42.97%), and the respondent's school being closer to achieving its overall wellness goals (47.46%). A small majority of respondents (50.67%) reported having no opinion on the program's impact on improving students' overall health.

Seventy-two percent of respondents reported being satisfied or very satisfied with the alternative breakfast program overall.

# FINANCIAL IMPACT

To capture the financial impact of the Alternative Breakfast Service model funding on the participating division's school food program, interviews were conducted with division nutrition directors for divisions with at least one school participating in the program that did not participate in the prior program year. A sample of 10% of such divisions were interviewed. Among the division nutrition directors interviewed, there was near universal agreement that the additional funding provided allowed divisions to expand breakfast service with minimal changes to staff or equipment and greatly improved the participation in school breakfast programs. Many divisions reported difficulty capturing the exact financial impact of the program funding due to the ongoing impact of the COVID-19 pandemic during the 2021-2022 school year.

# SUMMARY

Wide variation in the availability of in-person instruction during the 2021-2022 school year and flexibilities in federal requirements allowed school divisions to tailor the methods by which they distributed breakfast meals to students. Examples of the ways in which school divisions distributed breakfast meals include bulk grab and go, and parent or guardian pick up of meals. As is required by Chapter 1 of the 2022 Special Session Acts of Assembly, the Virginia Department of Education (VDOE) collected required data from schools receiving funding for the alternative breakfast service model in program year 2021-2022. Due to the waived reporting

requirements in the 2019-2020 and 2020-2021 program years, comprehensive comparative analysis of program data is limited for program year 2021-2022.

# **APPENDICES**

## Appendix A

### Item 145 C.29.c.1)-3), Chapter 1, 2022 Special Session I Acts of Assembly:

c.1) Out of this appropriation, \$1,074,000 the first year and \$1,074,000 the second year from the general fund is provided to fund an After-the-Bell Model breakfast program available on a voluntary basis to elementary, middle, and high schools where student eligibility for free or reduced lunch exceeds 45.0 percent for the participating eligible school, and to provide additional reimbursement for eligible meals served in the current traditional school breakfast program at all grade levels in any participating school. The Department of Education is directed to ensure that only eligible schools receive reimbursement funding for participating in the After-the-Bell school breakfast model. The schools participating in the program shall evaluate the educational impact of the models implemented that provide school breakfasts to students after the first bell of the school day, based on the guidelines developed by the Department of Education and submit the required report to the Department of Education no later than August 31 each year.

2) The Department of Education shall communicate, through Superintendent's Memo, to school divisions the types of breakfast serving models and the criteria that will meet the requirements for this State reimbursement, which may include, but are not limited to, breakfast in the classroom, grab and go breakfast, or a breakfast after first period. School divisions may determine the breakfast serving model that best applies to its students, so long as it occurs after the instructional day has begun. The Department of Education shall monthly transfer to each school division a reimbursement rate of \$0.05 per breakfast meal that meets either of the established criteria in elementary schools and a reimbursement rate of \$0.10 per breakfast meal that meets either of the established criteria in middle or high schools.

3) No later than July 1 each year, the Department of Education shall provide for a breakfast program application process for school divisions with eligible schools, including guidelines regarding specified required data to be compiled from the prior school year or years and for the upcoming school year program. The number of approved applications shall be based on the REPORT ON ALTERNATIVE SCHOOL BREAKFAST SERVICE MODELS

estimated number of sites that can be accommodated within the approved funding level. The Department of Education shall set criteria for establishing priority should the number of applications from eligible schools exceed the approved funding level. The reporting requirements must include: chronic absenteeism rates, student attendance and tardy arrivals, office discipline referrals, student achievement measures, teachers' and administrators' responses to the impact of the program on student hunger, student attentiveness, and overall classroom learning environment before and after implementation, and the financial impact on the division's school food program. Funded schools that do not provide data by August 31 are subject to exclusion from funding in the following year. The Department of Education shall collect and compile the results of the breakfast program and shall submit the report to the Governor and the Chairs of the House Appropriations and Senate Finance and Appropriations Committees no later than November 1 following each school year.

#### **Appendix B**

#### Fiscal Year 2016 Study

In July 2015, VDOE released Superintendent's Memo #172-15 announcing the first year of applications for an alternative school breakfast service pilot or expansion of traditional breakfast service model supported by \$537,297 in state funds. For the 2015-2016 school year, 226 schools within 52 divisions received funding for alternative breakfast. Seventeen additional schools were selected to expand their traditional school breakfast programs.

Participating schools provided an additional 1,266,555 meals to students during the pilot year, a 13.6 percent increase from the previous year. School staff reported few challenges during implementation of the alternative school breakfast program, and the implementation costs for most schools were minimal. In addition, 54 percent of participating schools showed an increase in breakfast meals served in conjunction with an increase in one or both state standards of learning (SOL) assessment pass rates in reading or math.

#### Fiscal Year 2017 Study

In fiscal year 2017, \$1,074,000 in state funds were available through a competitive application process to support implementation of alternative breakfast service models or expand traditional breakfast service. More than 750 schools applied for funds, and 463 schools across 84 divisions were selected to receive funding.

Schools participating in the 2016-2017 school year provided an additional 1,435,256 breakfast meals to students compared to the 2015-2016 school year, and an additional 3,159,846 breakfast meals to students compared to the 2014-2015 school year. This represents nearly a 19 percent increase in breakfast meals served since state funds were available. School-level outcome metrics showed small but statistically significant decreases in attendance and increases in school nurse visits. Most schools that received two years of funding showed greater growth in meals served and pass rates on state assessments in the first year of implementation and were able to maintain those gains through the second year.

#### Fiscal Year 2018 Study

The 2018 Appropriation Act provided \$1.1 million in state funds for the operation of breakfast after the bell programs in fiscal year 2018 in eligible schools. Seven hundred sixty-four schools applied for funding and 450 schools across 83 school divisions were selected to receive funding in school year 2017-2018.

Schools implementing alternative breakfast service models in the 2017-2018 school year saw an increase in the number of breakfast meals served per student and reported a decrease in student hunger in the morning. The majority of schools examined for fiscal impact demonstrated decreased meals costs after implementation, indicating a more efficient use of staff and resources.

#### Fiscal Year 2019 Study

The 2019 Appropriation Act provided \$1.074 million in state funds for the operation of alternative school breakfast service models implemented in the 2018-2019 school year. Three hundred twenty-five schools within 66 school divisions were selected to receive funding. Of the 325 participating schools, 179 schools were elementary schools and 146 schools were secondary schools or centers. In addition, 170 of the 325 participating schools received state funding for alternative breakfast service models for the first time in 2018-2019 and 155 schools received state funding previously.

Schools receiving state funding for alternative breakfast programs increased the average number of breakfast meals served per student in the first year of implementation by eight percent. Schools receiving multiple years of state funding were able to sustain increases in meals served over time. Survey data indicated division and school staff were satisfied with the alternative school breakfast models implemented in their schools and perceived positive impacts on student hunger and the stigma associated with school breakfast program participation. Program impacts on self-reported student tardiness and office discipline referrals were mixed, but participating schools showed promising improvements in chronic absenteeism and student achievement. VDOE also found that the cost per breakfast meal served decreased in most schools following the implementation of the alternative breakfast program, offsetting additional food and equipment costs, and indicating a more efficient use of program staff and resources.

#### Fiscal Year 2020 Study

Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, the Governor of Virginia closed schools statewide March 13, 2020, and schools remained closed through the remainder of the 2019-2020 school year. In May of 2020, the Superintendent of Public Instruction issued and the Secretary of Education approved an emergency relief measure that waived certain school division reporting requirements for the alternative breakfast service program. This waiver was in accordance with Chapters 1283 and 1289 of the 2020 Acts of Assembly providing the Superintendent of Public Instruction the authority to grant temporary flexibility or waivers for certain deadlines and requirements as provided in the Title 22.1 of the Code of Virginia and Appropriation Act that cannot be met for fiscal year 2020 (school year 2019-2020) or fiscal year 2021 (school year 2020-2021) due to the state of emergency and subsequent school closures. Waived reporting requirements included tardy arrivals; office discipline referrals; student achievement measures; teachers' and administrators' responses to the impact of the program on student hunger, student attentiveness, and overall classroom learning environment before and after implementation; and the financial impact on the division's school food program in its annual program report.

Due to the waived reporting requirements, this report on alternative breakfast models for the 2019-2020 school year is limited to data on number of eligible breakfast meals served, which were collected from August 2020 through April 2021. The truncated 2019-2020 school year does not permit comparisons to previous, complete years of school nutrition program data.

#### Fiscal Year 2021 Study

Due to the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic, the Superintendent of Public Instruction issued and the Secretary of Education approved an emergency relief measure that waived certain school division reporting requirements for the alternative breakfast service program. This waiver was in accordance with Chapters 1283 and 1289 of the 2020 Acts of Assembly providing the Superintendent of Public Instruction the authority to grant temporary flexibility or waivers for certain deadlines and requirements as provided in the Title 22.1 of the Code of Virginia and REPORT ON ALTERNATIVE SCHOOL BREAKFAST SERVICE MODELS

Appropriation Act that cannot be met for fiscal year 2020 (school year 2019-2020) or fiscal year 2021 (school year 2020-2021) due to the state of emergency and subsequent school closures. Waived reporting requirements included tardy arrivals; office discipline referrals; student achievement measures; teachers' and administrators' responses to the impact of the program on student hunger, student attentiveness, and overall classroom learning environment before and after implementation; and the financial impact on the division's school food program in its annual program report.

Due to the waived reporting requirements, this report on alternative breakfast models for the 2020-2021 school year is limited to data on number of eligible breakfast meals served. The truncated 2020-2021 school year does not permit comparisons to previous, complete years of school nutrition program data.